The motion was adopted.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SYED SIBTEY RAZI) : We shall now take up clause-by-clause consideration of the Bill.

Clauses 2 and 3 were added to the Bill..

Clause 1, the Enacting Formula and Title were added to the Bill.

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF PETROLEUM AND NATURAL GAS (CAPT. SATISH SHARMA) : Madam, I beg to move :

That the Bill be returned.

The question was put and the motion was adopted

STATEMENT BY MINISTER

Investigations abroad concerning suspects Involved in Bombay blasts

THE MINISTER OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS (SHRI DINESH SINGH) : Hon'ble Members will have [v] seen various reports in the media in India and abroad regarding the course of investigations concerning suspects involved in the Bombay bomb blasts case.

The External Affairs Ministry received the information from the investigating authorities that nine members of the Memon family, all Indian nationals, were in UAE or Saudi Arabia and requested us to seek the support of the Governments to apprehend them and make them available for investigation. The Ministry took up the matter with the Governments concerned immediately. Our request to the UAE was made before the departure of the suspects from UAE. Reports appearing in the media perhaps cautioned the culprits and six of them were able to flee just in time.

From the information so far available with us, there is confirmation that six members of the Memon family, namely, Abdul Razak Suleman Memon, Smt. Hanifa Memon, Yakub Abdul Razak Memon, Smt. Rahin Memon, Essa Abdul Razak Memon, Yusuf Abdul Razak have flown from Dubai to Karachi on March 17. We have sought the cooperation of the Pakistan Government in locating these persons and sending them back to India for questioning.

The suspects being Indian citizens, there is every expectation that all friendly Governments will cooperate in tracing such persons for questioning by our investigating authorities. The absence of any formal agreements with any other country regarding extradition is no impediment to international cooperation in regard to persons wanted for crimes such as terrorism. I would like to add that we have received a great measure of cooperation from the friendly Government of the UAE.

The criminal investigations are being conducted by the investigating authorities and are not the responsibility of the Externa! *Affairs Ministry except* when foreign countries are to be approached.

It is not advisable, while sensitive investigation are in progress with the assistance of some friendly countries, to make any premature disclosure. We must also give an opportunity for quiet diplomacy to work through the normal channels. Disclosures and speculations in the media are not the course Government can adopt. It could be embarrassing to the countries which are trying to assist us. However, I wish to re-assure Hon'ble Members that the investigations are being pursued vigorously in all the quarters concerned, the requests for assistance have been made in a timely manner.

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH (MAHARASHTRA) : Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, I am very grateful to you for giving me an opportunity to seek clarifications on the statement made by the Minister of External Affairs. I agree with the Minister in what he says, "It is not advisable, while sensitive investigations are in progress with the assistance of some friendly countries, to make any premature disclosure. We must also give an opportunity for quiet diplomacy to work through the normal channels. Disclosures and speculations in the media are not the course the Government can adopt. It could be embarrassing to the countries which are trying to assist us." But I would like to point out that here we have a situation where one of the horrific incidents in the history of our nation has taken place where, within a very short space of time, a large

number or individuals were killed deliberately through the planting of major explosive devices. And the cost of those devices was so high that it is not possible for any one terrorist organisation to do it by themselves. It has got to be some kind of a hostile Government involved in this whole process. And we also know that in the past we have faced a very strange and peculiar situation from our neighbour. Our neighbour has been conducting a proxy war in this country. The green land of Punjab was a victim of it. The beautiful valley of Kashmir is still reeling under the impact of what is going on there. And now, we are told that these suspects have landed in Karachi. I have great apprehensions, Mr. Vice-Chairman, and I would like to voice them very clearly. Experience in the past has shown us that when a plane was hijacked via the same country, it was the intelligence agency of that country which supplied arms and ammunition to the hijackers on board. Arms and ammunition which were seized were traced to the Pakistan army. I remember the day when the hijacking took place, I sought clarifications from the hon. Minister and the disclosures came later. It is a fact that they are hostile to us, whatever they may say. I agree that it is not advisable to make any disclosure while sensitive investigations are in progress with the aid of friendly countries. Here, you are not dealing with a friendly country. You are dealing with a hostile country. Now, I would like to seek clarifications from the hon. Minister. My first question is : in the face of this hostile country, my apprehension is that these individuals will be given fresh identities, will then become fugitives from justice, and even when the entire world community may want them, they will not be available. In the past, hijackers have got away. In the past, murderers have got away. In the past, terrorists have got away. It is high time for the declaration of Pakistan as a terrorist State. I demand that the Government must make a statement on this. The Minister must tell us, must share with us as to the steps for having Pakistan declared a terrorist state by the international community. I would like to know what steps you are taking in this regard. I would further like to know what pressure we art bringing to bear upon our neighbouring country to make sure that 'they do not do to us what they have been doing in the past. I have great apprehensions.

This is my second apprehension that 1 would like to mention. This statement deals with the post-blast situation—after lepcrts appeared in the newspapers and after the External Affairs Minisitry received the information etc. I would like to know from the hon. Minister as to what happened prior to the blast. Did the External Affairs Ministry through its agencies, especially through Mr. Lamba, our High Commissioner in Islamabad, get information that such an incident might take place ? Did they get this information ? Did the External Affairs Ministry have any information that there was a large scale transportation of illegal consignment of arms which was sent to Bombay from this neighbouring country ? Did the External Affairs Ministry have this information ? If so, what did they do with it ?

Sir, my last point is—I am sorry you are looking at the clock, I know—is about the Memon's family. I would like to know whether all the member of Memon's family have arrived in Karachi. My information is that only six members have come out of nine. The remaining three are still in the UAE.

AN HON. MEMBER : In Saudi Arabia.

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH : Or in Saudi Arabia as you say. I do not know where exactly they are. They could be anywhere. I would like to know what is being done about these three. I would like to know as to what efforts we are undertaking at this moment, whether we will be in a position to get them back, whether we will be able to know the brain behind the whole situation. I am sure this family, by itself, could not have planned all this. It is not this family alone which has done all this ... *{Interruptions)* ...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SYED SIBTEY RAZI) : Please carry on.

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH : I would like to have specific answers from the hon. Minister to these specific queries which I have raised.

Thank you, Sir.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SYED SIBTEY RAZI) : Mr. Sukomal Sen.

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN (West Bengal) : Sir, the statement of the hon. Minis ter causes deep concern to all of us. I would like to seek some clarifi cations from the hon. Minister about what he said in his statement. Sir, the bomb blast took place on 12th March. Immediately, the Home Minister came out with his comments that foreign hands were involved. The Prime Minister also said that the 'brain is outside but the hand is inside'. So, the Government had the information or got the suspicion that without a foreign brain, this could not have happened at all. I would like i to know specifically from the hon. Minister as to when the Memon family fled to the UAE, when the Government of Dubai was requested by the Govern ment of India to nab thsm and hand them over to the Government of India. It seems they have taken too much time to write to Pakistan. It means that from 12th March to 17th March, they were either somewhere in India or in Dubai. I would also like to know when the Dubai Government was informed about it and what ac'ion the Dubai Government has taken to apprehend those culprits.

Another thing is, immediately after the bomb blasts, the ruling party's spokesman came out with a statement that the hand of ISI of Pakistan was there. Mr. Gadgil was on record saying that the hand of ISI of Pakistan was there. When a ruling party's spokesman came with such a statement, it is somewhat a sem'-official statement. I has some official sanction behind it. Otherwise, the ruling party's spokesman would not say like that.

[THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI V. NAR VYANASAMY) IN THE CHAIR] And, Sir, that was before the 17th, before they reached Pakistan. I would like to know whether 'he Government had any information that the Pakistan Government had definitely a hand in it. It seems from the statement that they have gone to Pakistan. Today, I have read in the newspapers that the Pakistan Government has assured the Central Government that they will co-operate in finding out the culprite and in the investigation. After the 17th, on which date did the Indian Government request Pakistan to find out the culprits and hand them over of the Indian Government ? In particular, at what level were they asked, whether the Prime Minister of India personally talked to the Prime Minister of Pakistan or the talk was at the High Commissioner level or *a** the Foreign Minister level ? I am asking this because this will indicate seriousness with which the Government of India had taken up this matter with the Government of Pakistan.

Now, Sir, I do not know what the Government of Pakistan has said. 1 would like *'o* know what the Pakistan Government's reactions are after the Indian Government took up the matter with them. The point is that Pakistan is run by the Islamic fundamentalists and Pakistan is also crealing problems in Punjab and Kashmir. The neighbouring country of Pakistan is Afghanistan. The American imperialists and Pakistan together tried to dismantle the progressive and secular Government of Afghanistan and, ultimately, they succeeded also. Now, in Afghanistan, we find tha* a terrorist Government has taken over. The Islamic fudamentalists have taken over in Afghanistan and that is a neighbouring country of Pakistan and this poses a great danger to India because, I remember, when these people were figh ing the Najibullah Government, many in this country were in great joy and cheerful. Now the terrorist have tnken over in Afghanistan. So, this poses a grave danger to us. Pakistan is ruled bv he Islamic fundamentalists while Afghanistan is ruled by a terrorists group. It is known all over the world and this poses a great danger to our country. I would like to know from the honourable Minister whether he has any clue to infer that

the terrorists in Afghanistan, 'with sophisticated arms provided by the- American imperialists and also by Pakistan, had any in the Bombay blasts. This is a pertinent point because they have gone to Pakistan. I: means there is a link. Otherwise, why should they go to Pakistan ? It is possible that they may go to Afghanis[f]an from Pakistan with the help of the fundamentalism. This the result of fundamentalism. It starts with religion and then it degenerates into terrorism and this is what is happening in Pakistan as well as in Afghanistan, and that can also happen in India if you don't prevent it.

So, Sir, these are very important issues and I hope that the honourable Minister will give specific replies, particularly to the question about the information they have about Pakistan and its ISI having a hand in this. Thank you, Sir.

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर (उत्तर प्रदेश): वाइस चेयरमैन महोदय, मैं समझता हूं कि जितना समय श्री विश्वजित पृथ्वीजित सिंह को और दूसरों को मिला है उतना कम से कम मुझे भी देंगे, कृपा करके रोकेंगे नहीं ।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRH1 V. NARAYANASAMY) : Don't order like this. You just speak.

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : मैं तो निवेदन कर रहा हूं । पहला प्रश्न यह है कि आज इतने दिनों के बाद हमारे विदेश मंत्री महोदय को यह वक्तव्य देने की आवश्यकता क्यों पड़ी क्योंकि इस वक्तव्य में कुछ कहा नहीं गया है, बल्कि इम्प्रेशन यह मिलता है कि अपनी जिम्मेदारी को इंवेस्टिगेशन करने वालों पर या जो मिडिया है उस पर टालना चाहते हैं, इसका तो मतलब यही है । उन्होंने बार-बार कहा है और कोई तथ्य नहीं कहा है, कोई विशेष बात नहीं कही है, लेकिन उलाहना यह दिया है कि जब हमें मालुम हुआ इंवेस्टिगेशन करने का तो हमने कर दिया, वरना तो हम करते ही नहीं। दूसरी बात यह कि मिडिया ने उनका प्रचार कर दिया तो वे भाग गये । ये दो बातें मुख्य रूप से निकलती हैं जो अपने बचाव के लिए इन्होंने कही हैं। इसलिए मेरा पहला प्रश्न यह है कि विदेश मंत्रालय को इतने दिनों के बाद यह वक्तव्य देने की आवश्यकता क्यों पड़ी जिसमें कुछ भी नहीं कहा गया है, ऐसी प्रेरणा उन्हें क्यों मिली ? आप कहते हैं कि :

6.00 P.M.

"The External Affairs Ministry received the information."

आपको इन्फर्मेशन कब मिली ? कब का मतलब, किस दिन, कितने बजे मिली और क्या आपको-दुनिया भर में मालूम हो गया आ ने कहा है कि मीडिया ने बताया तो क्या विदेश मंत्रालय को पता नहीं लगा ? अगर पता नहीं लगा तो आपने आसपास के देशों से संपर्क करके अपने तरफ से कार्यवाही की शुरुआत क्यों नहीं की ?

तीसरा, यह हम जानते हैं कि पाकिस्तान हमारा मित्र नहीं है, द्वेषी है । आ ने इतना कहा है कि जो मित्र देश हैं वे हमारी सहायता करेंगे । पाकिस्तान से आपने सहायता की मांग की है लेकिन आशा कोई व्यक्त नहीं की है । आपने कहा कि मित्र देशों से सहायता की आशा करेंगे । लेकिन पाकिस्तान के बारे में आपने कुछ नहीं कहा । यद्यपि झूठे दिखावे के लिये पाकिस्तान के प्रधानमंत्री का वक्तव्य आया है कि हम सहायता करेंगे । मगर इसमें संदेह यह होता है कि आ को भी विश्वास नहीं है कि पाकिस्तान ईमानदारी से काम करेगा । अगर नहीं है तो मैं समझता हूं कि आपका विश्वास ठीक है क्योंकि जैसे पहले मित्र ने कहा, जब हवाई जहाज उड़ाकर ले गये थे तो उसने उनको प्रोटेक्शन दिया, हथियार दिये और आज तक कुछ नहीं किया । तो मेरा प्रश्न यह है कि अगर सहायता है तो उसके विरोधी रवैये के बावजूद, होस्टायल रवैये के बावजूद आप पाकिस्तान से उन गुनहगारों को, शरारतियों को निकाल कर लाने की क्या व्यवस्था करेंगे ? इसमें मेरा यह भी प्रश्न है कि क्या कदम उठा रहे हैं,

पाकिस्तान को टैरोरिस्ट स्टेट घोषित करने के लिये ? नहीं उठाये हैं लेकिन सभी मांग करेंगे कि टैरोरिस्ट स्टेट घोषित किया जाना चाहिये ।

चौथा, जो नौ लोग हैं, उनमें से मेरे मित्र ने पूछा, 6 तो आपने कब दिये लेकिन बाकी तीन कौन हैं ? ये तीन पुरूष हैं या महिलायें हैं, इसकी जानकारी दे दी जाये और इन तीन के बारे में आपने किन-किन देशों को कहा है ? समाचार-पत्रों से यह पता लगता है कि पाकिस्तान छोड़कर भी वे भाग सकते हैं । तो आपने क्या पाकिस्तान की सरकार से इस विषय में और सूचना देकर उन से आग्रह किया है क्या नहीं किया है ?

अंत में, क्या आपने इन देशों को, यूनाइटेड एमिराट्स, सऊदी अरबीया और पाकिस्तान भी है, इन देशों को आ .ने भारत की इन्वेस्टी-गेशन टीम भेजने की दृष्टि से कोई मांग की है या नहीं की है ? अगर अपनी टीम जायेगी तो वह बहुत कुछ पता लगा सकती है । यह गृह मंत्रालय नहीं कर सकता है । यह जानकारी क्या आपने उनसे चाही है कि हम अपनी इन्वेस्टीगेशन टीम भेजना चाहते हैं आप उसकी सहायता करें । आपने क्या ऐसी सहायता मांगी है या नहीं ?

पांचवां, क्या आपने एस्ट्रार्डिक्शन पाकिस्तान से, यूनाइटेड अमिरात से या जो और देश हैं क्या उनसे आपने रेक्वेस्ट की है कि उनको भेजें ? अगर की है तो कब की है और उनका जवाब क्या मिला है ?

SHRI JAGESH DESA1 (Maharashtra) : Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, in the bomb blast at Bombay, about 250 persons were killed and about 1,000 persons were injured and many of the them critically. This ghastly bomb blast has affected our economy also. And I am sure the Government must be very serious and keen to find out who the culprits are. So, I would just put some puestions on that.

Sir, I would like to know from the hon. Minster whether the photographs of thess six or nine members of the Memon family were flashed to UAE or not, and whether the photographs of these passport holders are with the Passport Office or not' I want to know whether somebody was flown to UAE with these photographs or not. The bomb blast took place on the 12th, and we are told that some of them left even before the blast took place. If that is true that for five days they were in the U.A.E., I would like to know as to when the Maharashtra Government requested the Central Government to take up with the U.A.E., in respect of these 6 or 9 persons, and on what date they did it. Secondly, I want to know whether our Embassy there was alerted. It is very strange that even after the information that they were in the U.A.E., they were able to fly to Pakistan. I want to know whether the photographs of these persons were available at the airport. When were the tickets issued to them. I also want to know whether any check was conducted at that time and whether our Goverment or Embassy officials alongwith the officials of the U.A.E., were at the airport on all these 3 or 4 or 5 clays. It is very strange that in spite of having been informed, these persons could not be apprehended. I want to know if there has been any kind of slackness on the part of our officials also and also the U.A.E., officials and whether any enquiry will be conducted to ascertain it. By which airlines these persons flew from Bombay to U.A.E. and by which airlines they went from the U.A.E., to Karchi? Sir, the the Minister has said in his statement that they informed the Government of U.A.E., When did you inform them ? On what date, did you ask the Pakistan Government to investigate and take action against them ? I also want to know whether you have supplied photographs of these six persons to Pakistan Government. Sir, the hon. Minister said about the investigation being conducted. We do not hampsr that investigation. We do not want to come in the way of this investigation. But the whole nation is watching us to find out as to what extent we have progressed in our enquiry after the lapse of about 10 or 12 days, and whether there is any kind of slackness on the part of your Ministry also. I would also like to know as tc when the passports of these persons were renewed.

I am sure thw tthe Minister will look into all these things. I feel from the

statement that there is some slackness somewhere and I have my doubts whether the officiate-in our Embassies have taken it very seriously. The Minister must make an enquiry and enlighten the House on the questions which 1 have raised.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY) Mr. Lather, not here Dr. Sivaji.

DR. YELAMANCHILI SIVAJI (Andhra Pradesh) I am glad that the Minister came out with a statement. If not with full details, he did come with some
statement.

Jl is for quite sometime that our neighbouring countries have been indulging in so much of terrorist activities and are encouraging the people here to indulge in these activities. The hon. Home Minister also said in the House that it is the handiwork of some foreign country which is encouraging terrorists inside the country. On that day.. Mr. Gurudas Das Gupta was seeking clarifications but the Home Minister stuck to his point. Not only that. By importing various weapons, almost the entire country has become an armoury. Weapons are being supplied to all the terrorists to whatever group they may belong, whether iney are from the L.T1E, whether they are Naxalites or from Kashmir or ULFA. Arms like AK-47 rifles and other weapons are being supplied to them freely like vegilables, and the Government is soft-paddling for variousi obvious reasons. It may be due to some international diplomacy or whatever it is.

In this connection, I would like to seek a clarification from the Minister whether the Government is thinkink on the lines of seeking any assistance from Israel to contain terrorism? It is mentioned several times that Israel is well-equipped to contain terrorism and it has proved it many a time. It was mentioned in a section of the press that some of the important people—it may be some Ministers; I may not contribute tc that thought— are connected with the Memon family. I am not seeking rmy clarification here whether some Ministers are connected with the Memon family or not ? But let us take a pledge. Let the Prime Minister come out with a statement that whatever it is—wuether in regard to thus incident or something—such persons will not be encouraaged. All political parties should make it a point that they will not encourage any violence, that they will not encouraging any vodent activities, criminal activities, from their side. Let the Prime Minister come out with a statement that the Congress Party is not offering any party posts or giving any responsibility, within or outside the party, to those who are connected with criminal activities. For this purpose, the Prime Minister who happens to be the President of the A.I.C.C., unless he relinquishes...

SHRI JAGESH DESAI : Sir, now is it all relevant ?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY) : Dr. Sivaji, You have to seek clarifications on the statement. Kindly conune yourself to the statement.

DR. YELAMANCHILI SIVAJI : I feel that it is relevant.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY) : It is out of context. Therefore, kindly confine yourself to the statement.

DR. YELAMANCHILI SIVAJI : 1 say that the Prime Minister who is the President of the A.I.C.C, who .s heading one of the major national parties in the country, should convene a meeting of all political parties and evolve some guidelines that all those who are connected with voilent and criminal activities will be debarred from the membership of any political party. If this is done, I hope it will go a long way. I am sure Mr. Jagesh Desai will also support this. Thank you.

SHRI G. G. SWELL (Meghalaya) : Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, this being the first time that I am having an exchange with my good friend, Mr. Dinesh Singh, let me say that 1 am happy that he is back to his old pasture as the Minister of External Affairs and I extend to him my goodwill, good wishes and co-operation.

SHRI JAGD1SH PRASAD MATHUR : Goodwill under the shadow of bomb blasts ?

SHRI G. G. SWELL : In the first place, Mr. Vice-Chairman, I was intrigued

when I came back to the House and found this 'Supplementary List of Business that the Minister of External Affairs was going to make a statement on investigations abroad of the suspects in the Bombay bomb blasts.

I agree with him when he says that there should not Ds any premature disclosure and the whole thing has been put under the cloak of extreme seuecy. That is why I ask why. What has motivated him to volunteer and come forward with this statement ? Now, to me, there seems to be only one thing that appears to be relevant—the mention that these suspects are in Karachi. Saying this in this House, this forum, which will have national and international publicity, will put Pakistan in a spot. To say that they are in Karachi and what they we going to do about it— that is the only purpose I can see in your coming forward with this statement. You can clarify it. Well, you may not also.

In regard to the statement, there are many things which are intriguing. The Minister says that on the request of the intelligence agencies, his Ministry had communicated it to the U.A.E., Dubai and all that sort cf thing. Well that is, of course, the normal course. He says here that the intelligence agencies said that the suspects were either in U.A.E. or in Saudi Arabia. I am mentioning this because I have a point to make later on. He says that the request to the U.A.E. was made before the depaiiure of the suspects from U.A.E. He also mentions the date when they had gone to Pakistan. It is March 17, i.e. five days after all these horrible things had happened in Bombay. There is a report, Mr. Vice-chairman, in a section of the press that the Police Chief of Dubai had yone on record saying that he received instructions, or, he received the request from India, very late, after the suspects had fled Dubai. He has said that if he had got information in time, he could have arrested them, he could have kept them with him. I would like to know whether this is correct. If so, it was a very serious lapse on our part. Or is it a baloney on the part of UAE in order to defame us ? Then we are ourselves derelict and that is why we could not do anything. This is a very serious point.

Another report in the press is that the Ministry of External Affairs was rather late, they did not react promptly and readily enough, they had delayed the matter in communicating with UAE, the whole delay occurred in this Ministry. I would like to know about this; this is also very important. *(Time Bell* rings). I am finishing.

Another thing is that the Memon family members have been known to be cfosed to the Bombay Mafia don Dawood Ibrahim. Everybody says that. I would like to know whether Dawood Ibrahim is still in Dubai or he has also fled from Dubai to Karachi.

Another report says that from Dubai they first went to Saudi Arabia and from Saudi Arabia they went to Karachi. This gives a new dimension to the whole thing that there has been some kind of co-operation, some k'nd of an attempt to play on Islamic fundamentalism. These are the points that by way of clarification I would like to ask from the Minister.

Lastly, Sir, I know, there have been discussions in the international forum-— I have not refreshed my memory—that there has been some agreement, some international convention by which the different countries in the world have agreed on certain dines of action in order to check terrorism. I would like to know whether we- can invoke that in this matter.

Lastly, Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, the East-West Airlines which is operating in India is a private enterprise. I am told that this belongs to Dawood Ibrahim. If so, it is a very serious matter. We would like this to be discussed and if the East—West Airlines is connected with Dawood Ibrahim and all these people suspected of this outrage on us, I think it is but right and fair to ask them to pack up and go.

विपक्ष के नेता (श्री सिकन्दर बख्त) : सदर साहब मिनिस्टर साहब ने फरमाया कि—

> "The criminal investigations are being conducted by the investigating authorities and are not the responsibility of the External Affairs Ministry."

मैं सिर्फ एक ही सवाल पूछना चाहता हूं। जैसा कि कहा जाता है कि इस खानदान का ताल्लुक माफिया की एक्टिविटीज से, अंडर-वर्ल्ड एक्टिविटीज से था, तो क्या पासपोर्ट इस किस्म के लोगों को दिया जा सकता है, दिया जाना चाहिए या नहीं, एक्सटर्नल एफेयर्ज मिनिस्ट्री की इस तरफ कोई त्वज्जह है कि नहीं ?

मैं सिर्फ इतना ही जानना चाहता हूं।

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA (West Bengal) : Sir, I join Mr. Swell in asking the Minister to tell the House clearly the purpose of the statement. According to the Minister this M,afia gang had fled to Pakistan on 17th. If so, why such as belated statement ? They had gone to Pakistan on 17th and today is the closing hour of 24th. Why did you take 7 days to share this important information ? I do not know whether it is so sensitive. Therefore, the Government must tell the House why such a belated statement and why the statement is being given at all.

The Government must let us know when they came to know that these people had actually landed in Pakistan. Sir, to me the information that these members of the mafiia gang had reached Pakistan is no less shocking than the bomb blasts that led to catastrophe, involving so many lives being lost. It is not only that we have lost so many people but it is also equally a matter of concern that a neighbouring country of India has become the landing place of the Mafia gang. Therefore, I would like to know from the Minister whether they have gone to Pakistan with the consent and approval of the Government of that country, whether they have gone there to enjoy a vacation or on pilgrimage or with the intention of finding political asylum. What is the information ? Is the Government of Pakistan aware that they have come there, or has the Government of India informed them ? And if the Government of India has informed them, what has been the response of the Government of that country ? Because, in that case, if the Government of Pakistan approves of the landing of a bunch of murderers in Pakistan, that gives a totally new dimension to international terrorsm. In that case Pakistan can be held responsible as a country abetting terrorism. Therefore, we must know whether the Government of Pakistan knows it and, if it does not know, whether you have told them and, if you have told them, what has been their response ? I would like to know whether the Government of India has told them that if these people are given asylum, that would be considered to be a rare case of unfriendly act against the people of India. Have you told them so ?

Sir, 1 believe, the people of Pakistan cannot be equated with the Government that rules there. The people of Pakistan are friendly to the people of India. I believe, therefore, that the Government of that country has to be told in clear terms about the impact of this development on this subcontinent, because it will have its ramifications in Indian politics. Let it be made very clear that if the Government of Pakistan gives them political asylum, it is going to strengthen the fundmentalist forces in India. They must be told that it will have its impact and the fragile secular environment is going to be further aggravated.

Sir, I am sorry, it is not a question of open diplomacy. It should have been a question of open diplomacy if the matter was not known to us. It is a question of active and open diplomacy; it is not a question of silent diplomacy. International pressure has to be built up in order to compel the Government of Pakistan if they are acting in collusion with the murderers. The ruling cliche of Pakistan has to be isolated and the opinion of the entire civilized world must be mobilized to ensure that this bunch of murderers are handed over to India. And, if it is so, we want an active diplomacy, we want an open diplomacy, we want a diplomacy which totally isolates Pakistan... *{Time-bell)...*

Sir, again I am sorry that Indian intelligence has totally failed—and the Minister of External Affairs has a role in it. Why ? India was never forewarned that such a conspiracy was being hatched outside the country. It was the job of India's international intelligence. We have not been forewarned. That is the first fa lure. The second failure is, we should have prejudged, with news

coming out in the press, that there was every possibility of these people slipping out of Dubai and, if they slipped out of Dubai, there was a possibility of their going to Pakistan. Therefore, what pre-emptive action had this Government taken to ensure that not only they did not go out of Dubai but also that at least they did not go to Pakistan ? If we had taken a pre-emptive action at the diplomatic level, what was the outcome ? That is very important for us to know.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY) : Kindly conclude.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA : Sir, my last point is, the Government must handle this issue with, care and caution. The Mafia gang of Pakistan must not be equated with the people. I take this opportunity once again to draw the attention of the Government to this. Mr. Chavan was giving the reply. He was the first person to speak of a foreign country. I was in Bombay. I read what he said in the press conference. He was the person who said that a foreign country was involved. The Prime Minister did not say so. Nor did the Minister of State for Internal Security spoke in this language. He again repeated it. Then, I asked him, "Do you say that it is a foreign country, or do you say that it is a foreign terrorist group ?" Again he said, "I stand by my statement." This was irresponsiable again. I am saying that even if Pakistan Goverment has given political asylum to this bunch of murderers, I do not believe, I cannot believe and I shudder to believe that the millions of people of Pakistan belong to the same category of political opportunists and conspirators. Therefore, a line has to be drawn. While fighting for their extradition, while fighting against the Mafia gang, we have to take care to ensure that the people of Pakistan are demarcated from that Government. Otherwise, the fallout will be the same on the Indian security environment.

SHRI MURLIDHAR CHANDiRAKANT BHANDARE (Maharashtra) : Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, let me at the outset congratulate the Bombay police which unearthed, in a matter of few hours and with admirable speed, and unfolded the diabolical international conspiracy and plan of a foreign country to destabilise and disturb the unity and" integrity of our country, cause panic and terror in our matron and mount an assault on our rapid economic growth. I am happy that the investigations were retained by the Bombay police and were not handed over to the CBI.

I take this opportunity to congratulate the Chief Minister and the Maharashtra Government for keeping a very high degree of morale and confidence among the people not only in Bombay, not only in Maharashtra, but in the whole of the country.

Coming to the statement, I think, the first thing, when the External Affairs Ministry is unfolding any conspiracy of this kind, is to give a chronological statement. In fact, it must contain a blow-by-blow account and the minute-to-minute details so that we can draw a correct inference whether a country has co-operated or it has not cooperated in this. I wish that this was done, and I hope that in the statement which will follow soon, the hon. External Affairs Minister will make good this omision.

He has said that the UAE has been Ij'endly to us. Well, the statement makes *no* bones about the fact that it has been probably equally or more friendly to the Memons and Pakistan. I would like to know—this is one question—the exact passport numbers and the dates on which these members of the Memon family went out of Dubai and went to Karachi.

Let me say, Sir, for the Minister of External Affairs, what he would not like to say but would like me to say. Well, everybody in Bombay is convinced, and the same is true of the country, that the ISI is directly involved in this conspiracy. It does look that they have not quite a bit of assistance even in Dubai. Sir, you talk of Pakistan as a friendly nation, but when you express your hope, let us look at their track record. They have continuously trained the terrorists in Punjab and in Kashmir. Have they admitted it at any time ? We know what that record is. I think we should not pull wool over our eyes any more and face the realities as they are. Therefore, I do not have the same confidence, which the hon. External Affairs Minister pretends to have in the cooperation of Pakistan. I think the time has come when it is not

merely a question of active and open diplomacy, as has been advocated by my esteemed hon. friend, Mr. Gurudas Das Gupta. I know diplomacy is sometimes silent. Sometimes it has to be persuasive, but today it is a time for very aggressive diplomacy on our part. We have stood for non-violence. Unless we eradicate terrorism from the face of this planet, we will not be discharging our duties and fulfilling our right role. I do not think that in any way the minorities in this country condone this act. At least in Bombay I have met thousands of them and they expressed their shock, abhorrence and even shame at what has happened in Bombay. So, you must also look at the very strong sentiments of the people of India in this matter.

Now, may I ask the hon. Minister to find out what steps he is taking to have the extradition treaty concluded as early as possible ? As I said, the *modus operandi* is that Pakistan gives fake and forged passports to the terrorists. They can give

[THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair]

Indian passports; they can give several other passports. I would not be surprised if by now the Memon family members are given even Pakistani passports. In such a case, what steps would we take to prevent these things from being done ? Above all, please tell us today as to what is the time limit within which you expect the Memon family to be brought to India, to be brought to book by the due process of law. I think that this is a time for all of us to remain united. Let us not feel ashmed of saying what we feel. I am quite sure that you would take quick steps to see that Pakistan is put on the list of terrorist nations. You must take steps to see that we remain active. Even yesterday large explosives had been detected in Bombay. The danger is looming large. It calls for no complacency. It does not call for evasive statements like this. What it calls for is not only open, active and aggressive, but also very effective diplomacy which will see elimination of terrorism from our planet.

उपसभापति : श्री सुरेश पचौरी : आप लोग एक-एक मिनट में पूछ लें, अगर इससे संबंधित कोई सवाल है तो क्योंकि बंबई के बम विस्फोट पर विस्तार से डिस्कशन हो चुका है ।

श्री सुरेश पचौरी (मध्यप्रदेश) : महोदया, लगातार यह देखने को मिल रहा है पिछले कई सालों से कि पाकिस्तान ने भारत के साथ अघोषित युद्ध डिक्लेयर कर दिया है । न केवल आतंकवादी गतिविधियों में पाकिस्तान भारत में दिलचस्पी ले रहा है बल्कि उन आतंकवादी गतिविधियों में संलग्न भी है । विदेशी ताकतों ने भी इस चीज को स्वीकारा है ।

महोदया, पिछले दिनों पंजाब के अमृतसर से कुछ लोग प्लेन हाईजेक करके पाकिस्तान ले गए यह छह लोग थे । उनको आज तक भारत सरकार वापस नहीं बुला पाई और आज स्टेटमेण्ट माननीय मंत्री जी ने दिया है कि कराची से उन्हें वापिस लाने की उम्मीद है । मैं यह जानना चाहता हूं मंत्री जी से कि आप किस आधार पर यह कह रहे हैं? केवल डिप्लोमेटिक चैनल से बात करने से काम इस मामले में नहीं चलने वाला है । जब आई० एस० आई० के माध्यम से हमारे यहां गड़बड़ी पैदा की जा रही है तो हमारी इंटेलीजेंस एजेंसियाँ, न केवल होम डिपार्टमेंट की बल्कि एम० ई० ए० की भी फेल हो चुकी है इस मामले में । एक तरफ मंत्री जी कहते हैं कि हमने संयुक्त अरब अमीरात को निकलने से पहले सूचित कर दिया था और दूसरी तरफ़ कहते हैं कि उससे हमें सहयोग मिला, ये दोनों अपने आपमें विरोधाभास की बातें हैं । दूसरी बात यह है कि मंत्री जी अपनी तरफ से पाकिस्तान से ये सारे लोग वापिस किए जाएं, इसके लिए क्या इंटरनेशनल प्रेशर यूज करेंगे ? इंटरनेशनल प्रेशर से मेरा तात्पर्य यह है कि वे देश जो पाकिस्तान को फाइनेंशियली या आर्म्स-एम्यूनेशन्स के माध्यम से या दूसरे माध्यम से मदद कर रहे हैं, क्या उन देशों की मदद लेकर इन लोगों को हम भारत को सौंपने के लिए ऐसा कोई प्रेशर बना सकते हैं ? साथ ही बम्बई बम्ब विस्फोट में संबंधित ये अभियुक्त साबित हो गए

हैं, और भी जो बहुत अभियुक्त हैं, वे विदेश न भाग जाएं, इसके लिए विदेश विभाग ने क्या तैयारी की है? मैं यह नहीं कहता कि वे यहां डिक्लेयर करें लेकिन निश्चित रूप से सतर्कता बरतनी जरूरी है। अभी पिछले सप्ताह ही भोपाल से एक पाक नागरिक पकड़ा गया है जिसके बारे में बहुत संदिग्ध रिपोर्ट छपी है। क्या भोपाल में और मध्य-प्रदेश के अन्य स्थानों में भी ऐसे लोगों के बारे में विदेश मंत्रालय को कोई जानकारी है जो विदेशों की मदद से बम्बई बम विस्फोट में संलग्न हैं? यदि है तो उसका ब्यौरा क्या है? साथ ही विदेश से पासपोर्ट लेकर लोग अलग-अलग नामों से आ जाते हैं, अलग-अलग नामों से हमारे यहां आकर आतंकवादी गतिविधियों में और इस प्रकार के बम्ब विस्फोटों में संलग्न न हों, इसके लिए क्या उपाय विदेश मंत्रालय के माध्यम से किए जा रहे हैं? क्योंकि पिछले दिनों की पाकिस्तान की गतिविधियां इस बात को साबित करती हैं कि पाकिस्तान हमारे देश में न केवल अराजकता का वातावरण स्थापित करना चाहता है बल्कि अशांति भी फैलाना चाहता है। तो ऐसी कौन सी वजह है कि जब हमने एक ऐसे देश को आगाह कर दिया था कि ये लोग बम्बई बम विस्फोट में शामिल हैं, तो हमने यह निगरानी क्यों नहीं रखी कि वे लोग पाकिस्तान जाकर सैटल हो सकते हैं, कराची ही जाकर सैटल हुए? इस सदन में भी कई बार यह बात उठी, बम्बई बम विस्फोट पर जब चर्चा हुई, कि पाकिस्तान का हाथ हो सकता है, तो कराची एयरपोर्ट पर हमारी तरफ से कोई ऐसी व्यवस्था क्यों नहीं की गई, यह मैं आपके माध्यम से जानना चाहता हूं? जो पंजाब से प्लेन हाई-जैक करके पाकिस्तान चले गए, जिन्हें भारत में अभी तक नहीं बुलाया गया है, वहां पंथिक कमेटी चला रहे हैं, उनको वहां सम्मानित किया जा रहा है तो क्या इन लोगों को भी वहां सम्मानित नहीं किया जाएगा, इनको संरक्षण नहीं दिया जाएगा, इसकी क्या गारंटी है? मंत्री महोदय अपने वक्तव्य में कह रहे हैं कि मैं अपने मित्र देश से ऐसी उम्मीद है, हम उसे मित्र देश के रूप में कैसे परिभाषित कर सकते हैं जो लगातार हमारे देश में अव्यवस्था फैला रहा है? हमें निश्चित रूप से इसके लिए बहुत सख्ती से पेश आना चाहिए, ऐसा मेरा आपके माध्यम से आग्रह है।

अंतिम बात मैं यह कहना चाहता हूं कि आज बम्बई में जो आर्म्स की रिकवरी हुई है, उसके लिए महाराष्ट्र की सरकार बधाई की पात्र है। हम मंत्री जी से यह जानना चाहते हैं कि जो आर्म्स-एम्यूनेशन्स जब्त हुए हैं उनमें विदेशी आर्म्स-एम्यूनेशन्स बहुत ज्यादा संख्या में हैं, तो वे कौन-कौन से देशों के आर्म्स एम्यूनेशन्स हैं? उन देशों से क्या आपने नाराजगी प्रकट की है? यदि नहीं की है तो क्या आप प्रकट करेंगे, क्योंकि उन देशों के बने हुए आर्म्स-एम्यूनेशन्स बम्बई में जब्त किए गए हैं, और जो जब्त किए गए हैं वे किन-किन देशों के बनाए गए आर्म्स-एम्यूनेशन्स हैं? उनका ब्यौरा क्या है, यह मैं जानना चाहता हूं?

SHRI HIPHEI (Mizoram) : Madam, Deputy Chairman, I have only one point to ask. The last sentence of the Minister's statement appears to me unsatisfactory. It says, "The investigations are being pursued vigorously in all the quarters concerned, the requests for assistance have been made in a timely manner." Madam, it is not a question of justifying what we have done or what we have not done. It is a question of how to get the culprits back to India for investigation. This reminds me of the incident of Entebbe in Uganda from where the hijacked passengers were rescued by the Israeli forces. Are we going to have oar own efforts or device or are we going *to* depend on foreign countries ? Are we going to know today where those murderers are hiding themselves ? We must be able to know the place, from here in India. Should we depend on foreign hands or wait for information from Pakistan ? Madam, the only clarification I seek is this. Are we going to have our own device, our own efforts or are we

going to depend on the Pakistani Government ? Thank you.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Thank you, Mr Minister.

THE MINISTER OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS (SHRI DINESH SINGH) : Madam, Deputy Chairman, I should like at the outset, to thank hon. Members for the various suggestions they have made in the intervention concerning this very great tragedy that has taken place in Bombay. I can assure them that their views would be conveyed to the appropriate authorities. I should also like to clarify, Madam, at this very stage that the Ministry of External Affairs does not have an investigating agency. We do not carry out any espionage in any other country. We are dependent on the investigating agencies which ask us to do certain things which we do for them. It is important to appreciate that in any country, the Ministry of External Affairs involves itself in the regular diplomacy with other countries. And, if we were to become an investigating and espionage agency, we would lose our credibility. There are other agencies, all over the world, which do that.

Now, Shri Vishvajit Singh spoke of our efforts to have Pakistan declared as a terrorist State. We have, from time to time, given concrete proof, to friendly countries, of Pakistan's direct involvement in terrorist activities in Kashmir, in Punjab and elswhere. As the House is aware, the Government of 'he United States has placed Pakistan on the watcb list' to investigate whether Pakistan is actually involved in State terrorism. This incident would be a further proof of Pakistan's direct involvement, if they do not hand over the Memon family. But the investigation, Madam, is not limited to the Memon family. That is one aspect. The investigating agencies would, no doubt, be looking at all other agencies, individuals and countries which could be involved in it. Therefore, the total focus is not only on the Memon family. The Memon family have been in the spotlight only because they went away at this crucial time, according to the information that we bad. to Dubai, may be to Saudi Arabia, and therefore, we approached these Governments to ensure that they should be apprehended and handed over to us for investigation. The Memon family does not consist only of the six persons who have gone over to Pakistan. There is a group of twelve of them and we have asked the countries concerned to try to locate them. That also applies as a thirteenth person to Mr. Dawood Ibrahim. So, we are in touch with these Governments. But more importantly, the investigating agencies are in touch with Interpol and other agencies with which they may have agreements or exchange of information. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI MURLIDHAR CHANDRAKANT BHANDARE : Madam, I think the perception of Memon is now clear that they are the hand in our country of the brain outside.

SHRI DINESH SINGH : I am not denying that. I am saying that this is only one aspect. There might be other people. Therefore, the investigating agencies would no doubt be looking at all of them. This is one aspect.

Shri Vishvjit Singh had also asked me about what message we had received from our High Commissioner in Pakistan and whether he had warned us of a ... *(.Interruptions)*

SHRI G. G. SWELL : Will you disclose that ? *(Interruptions)* I am saying whether this is not too sensitive a thing. *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The Minister is quite oomptent to decide to what extent he can disclose and to what extent he cannot.

SHRI G. G. SWELL : I have not taken much time of the House. I mentioned this in half a sentence.

SHRI DINESH SINGH : I mentioned this because there should be no apprehension that some definite information had been received by us which we concealed and therefore, I wanted to say that there was no definite information sent to us regarding bomb explosions likely to take place in Bombay. We get, from time to time, information from different people about what they ma y have been able to pick up in those countries, but that is usually passed on to the investigating agencies because they alone are in a position to assess them and act upon them.

Now, the other point that had been asked was, what are we doing about the other Memon family members who are not gone to Pakistan ? We are dependent on the countries whore we feel they have gone, to assist us in locating them and handing them over to us. As I said in the main body at my statement, in this regard, we are receiving considerable assistance from the Government of UAE.

Now, Shri Sukomal Sen had asked, when did we ask UAE ? We had received information from Bombay about their having gone to UAE and Saudi Arabia. This information came to us on the 16th afternoon. The same day we informed OUT Missions in U. A. E. and Saudi Arabia and they immediately took up the matter with the Governments of U.A.E. and Saudi Arabia. There was no delay on our part. The House will appreciate that these persons were in Dubai and we had to deal with the Federal Government in U.A.E., and, therefore, they sent the information to Dubai to take necessary action. There was a short time during which the police at Dubai could act because apparently they got wind of the possibility of our trying to get them out of Dubai. There was some media report. Probably based on that, some people had informed them. But the fact that they went from Dubai to Pakistan is in itself interesting. Why do we forget that if they had not gone to Pakistan from Dubai, many of the statements that have been made in the House today could not have been made ? And in an indirect manner, not because we wanted it, but as it turned out, it was interesting that they left Dubai to go to Pakistan where they probably felt they would be safer.

माथुर जी ने कई सवाल किए । उनका सबसे ज्यादा ऐतराज था कि यह स्टेटमेंट मैं क्यों दे रहा हूं। तो अगर मुझ से पहले कहते स्टेटमेंट मत दीजिए तो मैं शायद न देता, लेकिन हमारा यह विचार था कि बहुत सी बातें अखबारों में छप रही हैं, कुछ शायद गलतफहमी माननीय सदस्यों को हो, तो इस लिए जो खबर हमारे पास है वह हम उन को दे दें और इसके बारे में आगे जो कुछ भी सूचना होगी वह गृह मंत्रालय उन को देगा क्योंकि इंवेस्टिगेशन तो उनके हाथ में है। यह एक जो हिस्सा हम से कहा गया है कि आप और देशों से कहिए उस को हम ने पूरा किया और उस के बारे में कोई गलतफहमी न हो, इस लिए मैं आपके सामने आज आया जब कि हम को पूरी खबर मिल चुकी थी । इसके पहले हम आपको आधी या तिहाई खबर देते ।···

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : (उत्तर प्रदेश): जो भी खबर आज आपने दी है वह कौन सी खबर है बता दीजिए । तकलीफ तो यही है कि कोई खबर नहीं दी··· **(व्यवधान)**

श्री दिनेश सिंह : मैं नहीं जानता कि आप कौनसी खबर जानना चाहते हैं ?··· **(व्यवधान)**

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : आपने कहा है कि हमने यू० ए० ई० को लिखा, वह तो लिखते ही । लेकिन खबर तो कोई दी नहीं···· **(व्यवधान)**

श्री दिनेश सिंह : और हम क्या करते ? उनसे कह ही सकते थे । हम अपने आदमी को भेजकर वहां से पकड़ कर नहीं ला सकते।

दूसरी बात उन्होंने पूछी कि हमको कब खबर मिली और हमने कब लोगों को बताया, वह में अभी बता चुका हूं। अब इसमें उन्होंने एक बात और पूछी है कि भारत सरकार क्या कर रही है इन लोगों को पाकिस्तान में पकड़ने के लिए··· **(व्यवधान)**

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : मैंने यह पूछा था कि क्या आपने पाकिस्तान से यह मांग की है कि हमारी इंवैस्टिगेटिंग टीम वहां जाए ? इस प्रकार की आपने उनसे इजाजत मांगी है, रिक्वेस्ट की है या नहीं ?

श्री दिनेश सिंह : आप तो खुद अन्तर्राष्ट्रीय समस्याओं को समझते हैं हमारे चार आदमी जाकर वहां किस को कहां पकड़ लेंगे उनको क्या सूचना होगी। जो कुछ हम को मदद मिलेगी····

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : मैं बार-बार आपको टोकना नहीं चाहता, गलत होगा। लेकिन वहां की जो एजेंसीज हैं उनसे वे कोआप-रेट करेंगी। जो खतों-किताबत से या वायरलैस से जानकारी मिलती है उसकी अपेक्षा प्रत्यक्ष जाकर बहुत कुछ होता है, यह आप जानते हैं।

श्री दिनेश सिंह : अब आपके विचार तो उस समय के हैं जबकि खतो-किताबत का रिवाज नहीं था। व्यक्तिगत रूप से जाना पड़ता था। मैं यह अर्ज कर रहा हूं कि वहां जाकर भी उन पर निर्भर रहते तो उससे क्या फायदा होता। उनको यह कहने को मिलता कि आपने भी तो आकर देख लिया यहां कुछ नहीं मिला।

श्री जगेश देसाईजी ने यह पूछा कि क्या हमने उनकी तस्वीरों को उन देशों को भेजा है? जी हां, वे तस्वीरें उनको जा चुकी हैं, सब के पास पहुंच चुकी हैं। दूसरा सवाल था कि हमारा कोई अफसर गलती पर था या देर की? अगर की तो उनके खिलाफ क्या कर रहे हैं? मैं नहीं समझता हूं कि हमारे अफसरों ने कोई देर की। उन्होंने बड़ी मुस्तैदी से इस मामले को उठाया।

श्री जगेश देसाई (महाराष्ट्र) : आपने बताया कि 16 को ही आपको मिल गया।

My questions are not relevant because you said that you got the information from the Maharashtra Government only on 16th March.

श्री मूलचन्द मीणा (राजस्थान) : मंत्री जी ये तस्वीरें आपको कहां से मिली?

श्री दिनेश सिंह : आपको चाहिए तो आपको भेज देते हैं।

उपसभापति : अखबारों में छप रही हैं लोग कह रहे थे यह छिपी हुई बात नहीं है।

श्री मूलचन्द मीणा : सारे परिवार की अखबारों में छपी है क्या?

श्री जगेश देसाई : दुबई एयरपोर्ट पर इसके बाद निगाह रखी गई या नहीं मैं यह जानना चाहता हूं?

श्री दिनेश सिंह : अब मेरी कठिनाई यह है कि इनवैस्टीगेटिंग एजेंसीज ने क्या-क्या किया इसकी मुझ को सूचना नहीं है कि उन्होंने तस्वीर किस को दी, कब दी, कैसे दी! यह तो वही उस को देख रहे हैं। आपने जो खास सवाल पूछा कि तस्वीर पहुंची या नहीं वह मैंने बताया कि उनके पास तस्वीर भेज दी है। डा० शिवाजी ने पूछा

whether we had sought assistance from Israel. We are not required to seek assistance from Israel unless the investigating authorities ask us. *(Interruptions)* ...

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM (Andhra Pradesh) : Anyway, you are not competent *to* answer that question, Sir, because you are not investigating.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The Member should not have asked then. You should keep it in your mind for the next statement.

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM : He has something to do with the investigation. That is why he had asked that.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : How can the Minister of External Affairs... .

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM : We have asked the Minister in the beginning itself to be quite clear that he is not involved in the investigation.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : It is very clear that the External Affairs Ministry cannot take upon itself the investigation job. SHRI DINESH SINGH : The second question that he had asked was whether any Minister of the Government was connected with the Memon family. There ii no information so far that any Minister is

connected. He may have some information. *(Interruptions) ...*

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM : Sir, everything has appeared in the press. This question is based on the press reports only.

SHRI DINESH SINGH : If we go by everything that we read in the press it will be difficult for the Government to answer. *(.Interruptions)...*

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM : If you are quite sure that no Minister is involved, you deny it.

SHRI DINESH SINGH : How can I say whether somebody is involved or not involved ? I have no information. *(Interruptions) ...*

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM : Don't deny it then.

SHRI DINESH SINGH : You may be involved and I may be involved.

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM : Don't deny then.

SHRI DINESH SINGH : I am not denying. I am saying that I have no information that any Minister is involved. Kindly try to understand what I am saying. You don't put words in *my* mouth. I am grateful to Prof. Swell for the very kind words he has said about me. We are old friends. I don't mean age by that. I always look forward to his good whishes and cooperation. He has asked, why have we made this statement ? I have already tried to clarify it. I think, Mr. Swell wanted to know how we know that they are in Karachi. Mr. Swell, is it your question ?

SHRI G. G. SWELL (Meghalaya) : I said, they had been in Dubai for five days. Then you have said that on the 17th March they had gone to Karachi. Now, today is 24th March. That is what I asked.

SHRI DINESH SINGH : I was about to ...

SHRI G. G. SWELL : Please, one minute. You were kind enough to mention Dawood Ibrahim also. I have asked whether it is true—of course, it is not your job—that the East-West Airlines in India is owned by Dawood Ibrahim and whether you would ask the relevant Ministry *to* find out. If it is true, then we should wind it up.

SHRI DINESH SINGH : We have the flight number by which they left Dubai. They left Dubai by Pakistan Airways Flight No. PK-214. It was a direct flight to Karachi. Therefore, there is a conclusive proof that they went to Karachi.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : He is asking about the East West Airlines.

SHRI DINESH SINGH : I was coming *to* that. He has asked a number of questions. I am going one by one. One of the difficulties that every country faces about terrorism is that whatever may be the agency, intelligence agency, there are always some loopholes through which terrorists are able to penetrate and cause considerable destruction. Ours is not the only country. This happens in many countries i.e. the UK, with all their intelligence agencies, or the USA, for that matter. One takes precaution and one tries to have information in advance. When that comes h is easy to handle that. But sometimes this is not possible, as it happened in Bom-hay. I don't blame any of the agencies. Such ghastly acts are performed by a number of people, by individuals, by organised criminals and also by countries. As I said, vve have already sent the proof we had about the involvement of Pakistan in State terrorism to friendly countries. Prof. Swell also asked whether the East-West Airlines belonged to Dawood Ibrahim or not. Madam, I have no knowledge about that. But I shall pass on his message to the Ministry of Civil Aviation and Tourism. Thsy will, no doubt, look into that. Mr. Sikander Bakht wanted to know whether passports were given to them or not. Yes, they carried the Indian passports.

LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT) : No, that was not my question. I wanted to know the legali-ry of issuing passports to such characters. That was *my* question.

SHRI DINESH SINGH ; The passport *was* not issued to them in Dubai.

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : यहां हिन्दुस्तान में इस किस्म के लोगों को, जिनका माफिया कनेक्शन जाना जाता है, पासपोर्ट क्यों इश्यू किये गये ? मेरा ख्याल है कि ऐसे लोगों को पासपोर्ट इश्यू करना गैर-कानूनी होगा ।

SHRI DINESH SINGH : Passports are issued oil the basis of investigations made by the police. If the police say that passport can be issued to them, then it is given to them. As you know, Mr. Sikander Bakht, this matter ... *(interruptions)*. .

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT : They should never have been issued passports.

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : बहुत सारे सवाल हैं । अगर मुम्बई से पासपोर्ट जारी हुआ है तो क्या वहां की पुलिस मिली हुई थी, और अगर दिल्ली से हुआ तो किसने क्लियर किया ? महोदया, आप यह बतायें कि पासपोर्ट किसने रेकमेंड किया था और पुलिस ने कैसे रिपोर्ट दी उनके पक्ष में ?

श्री सुरेश पचौरी (मध्य प्रदेश) : महोदया, मंत्री जी दिलचस्प जवाब दे रहे हैं, दिलचस्प बातों का रहस्योद्‌घाटन कर रहे हैं । जब उन्होंने यह कहा कि मैमन परिवार के लोग कराची चले गये तो एक दिलचस्प बात हुई । जब कि बराबर इस बात की आशंका हो रही थी कि पाकिस्तान का हाथ था तो कम से कम वहां तो दिलचस्पी रखनी थी । मेरा कहना यह है कि मुंबई बम-ब्लास्ट के जो लोग अभियुक्त हैं, जो लोग इसमें संलग्न थे और जो संदिग्ध हैं, उनके बारे में मिनिस्ट्री ऑफ एक्स्टरनल एफियर्स ने क्या कार्यवाही करने की योजना बनायी है ? मेरा तात्पर्य यह है कि क्या उनके पासपोर्ट रद्‌द करने की आपने न केवल योजना बनायी है - क्योंकि हर चीज में यह बोला जा रहा है कि हमने खबर कर दी । प्रश्न यह है कि क्या किया है । क्या उनके पासपोर्ट रद्‌द कर दिये गये हैं, जो अभियुक्त थे, जो इसमें संलग्न थे और जो संदिग्ध हैं ? मुंबई बम ब्लास्ट में कौन लोग संदिग्ध हैं, किन लोगों पर [illegible] हैं और क्या आप उनके पासपोर्ट रद्‌द कर रहे हैं । पासपोर्ट जारी करने के पीछे पुलिस इन्वेस्टीगेशन है । पुलिस इन्वेस्टीगेशन की रिपोर्ट अब आ चुकी है कि कि मुंबई बम ब्लास्ट में इन लोगों का हाथ था । तो फिर उनके पासपोर्ट रद्‌द करने में इनके मंत्रालय को क्या परेशानी है?

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : सदर साहिबा, मैंने एक छोटा सा सवाल किया था मिनिस्टर साहब से । मैं फिर कहना चाहता हूं कि बुनियादी गलती इन जैसे लोगों को पासपोर्ट इश्यू करने की है । पासपोर्ट इश्यू करना या न करना यह आपके मंत्रालय के जिम्मेदारी है । अब यह मालूम करना चाहिए ये कि वे कौन लोग थे, जिनकी रिपोर्ट पर उनको पासपोर्ट इश्यू किये गये ?

श्री दिनेश सिंह : सिकन्दर बख्त साहब अच्छी तरह से जानते हैं कि सुप्रीम कोर्ट का फैसला है कि हर एक भारतीय नागरिक को अधिकार है, पासपोर्ट का । हमारे हाथ में . . . . . (**व्यवधान**) . . . . .
आप सुनना नहीं चाहते हैं तो आप ही बोलिये ।

लिहाजा यह हमारे हाथ में नहीं है कि हम बिना किसी वजह के किसी को पासपोर्ट न दें । हम पुलिस से पूछते हैं और वह अगर कहती है कि हां, उनके खिलाफ कोई शिकायत नहीं है, तो हमारे लिये पासपोर्ट देना अनिवार्य हो जाता है, जब तक कि हमारे पास दूसरी सूचना न हो । अगर हम पासपोर्ट न दें तो उनको अधिकार है कि वे कोर्ट से पासपोर्ट ले लें । बहुतों ने कोर्ट से पासपोर्ट लिये हैं ।

श्री गुरूदास दास गुप्ता जी ने कई सवाल पूछे । एक सवाल यह है कि क्यों नहीं अभी हम

...Why are we giving this statement? 1 have already clarified that. He wanted to know what is the response to our asking the Pakistan Government to apprehend

them and send them to us. We have sent for . the High Commissioner of Pakistan and conveyed this to him and pointed out to :him the serious implications of this. I might inform the House that we have received a message from the Pakistan High Commissioner that the Prime Minister of Pakistan Shri Nawaz Sharif, has authorised him to convey to us that he will cooperate with the Government of India in this matter and if these criminals are indeed in Pakistan they will do everything possible to apprehend them.

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH (Maharashtra.) : When was this message received?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now, I would request the hon. Members not to interrupt (he Minister. We started it at 5.30" p.m. and now it is 7.15 p.m.

SHRI DINESH SINGH : It was received on the 23rd of March, 1993, at 2145 hours.

उपसभापति : मंत्री जी, आपने बड़े विस्तार से बता दिया है जो आपके मंत्रालय से संबंधित है । जो दूसरे मंत्रालयों से संबंधित हैं उसकी आपकी जिम्मेदारी नहीं है ।

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH : Madam, after a long time, we have got an old-fashioned Minister who is a gentlemen who is- willing to reply to every single point raised by the Members. Let the Members have patience and hear the Minister.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA : Does it' mean that other Ministers ae not as gentlemanly as he is.

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM : It goes without saying.

SHRI VISHVJIT P SINGH : He is an old-fashiontd gentleman. That is what I said. Please do not distort what 1 said. You comrades are up to your own tricks. Please behave yourself.

SHRI D1NESH SINGH : Madam Deputy Chairman, the other point he asked was whether we were putting international pressure,,.of course, we have in formed the frienly countries of the situa tion and we expect them to assist us in this matter. Shri Bhandare had asked me to *give...(li!t'ji'niptio::ny-*

श्री सुरेश पचौरी : मेडम, उन देशों के नाम हम जानना चाहता थे जिनके माध्यम से हम इंटरनेशनल प्रेशर लगाएंगे ।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : These are the things which I don't think the Minister...*Interruptions)*

उपसभापति : मेडम, जब जवाब ही नहीं आएगा तो क्या फायदा ? फिर हम लोग जाएं **(व्यवधान)**

श्री दिनेश सिंह : आप सब नाम जान कर क्या लेंगे ? **(व्यवधान)**

SHRI SURESH PACHOURI : No, that is our right. Please don't speak like this. This is not the way. If we are treated like this while asking for carlifications, then there is no use sitting here.

श्री दिनेश सिंह : आप तो सुनने के लिए तैयार नहीं हैं **(व्यवधान)** आपने अपना सवाल पूछा, फिर सवाल पूछ रहे हैं, कितने सवालों का मैं जवाब दूं आपको . . . **(व्यवधान)**

SHRI SURESH PACHOURI : If I don't get the answer, I will ask. I will demand.

श्री दिनेश सिंह : यह तो डिप्टी चेयरमैन को तय करना है कि आपको जवाब मिल रहा है या नहीं मिल रहा है । **(व्यवधान)** किन-किन देशों को हमने एप्रोच किया है, यह मैं कैसे बता सकता हूं । यह तो इनवेस्टी-गेटिंग एजेंसीज ने जिसका बताया उसके हिसाब से हम कर रहे हैं। हम सब बातें यहां पर खोल दें तो इन्वेस्टीगेटिंग एजेंसीज क्या करेंगी ।

श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह : कम से कम संसद को तो विश्वास में लिया जाए ।

श्री दिनेश सिंह : म आपको पूरा विश्वास में लूं अगर इन्वेस्टीगेटिंग एजेंसीज मुझे विश्वास में लें ।

श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह : हम को इस बात का दुख है और आश्चर्य है कि आप अपने दल के सदस्यों को भी विश्वास में नहीं ले पा रहे हैं (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Just a minute, please, I have to bring order in this House. One thing is very clear thai the Members, in future, should put only limited questions to the Minister about the statement concerned If you ask questions which do not concern his Ministry, he cannot answer it and he is not bound *to* answer it. And I knew that the Minister cannot disclose a few things on the floor of the House which may hinder the investigation.

SHRI DINEH SINGH : Madam, this is what I said at the very beginning that 1 have certain limitations and I jun trying to answer to the best of my knowledge what can be disclosed. Un-less we all conform to it, we will only be hindering the investigating agency in its activities. If too much information is given, then those who are responsible for what happened in Bombay will get to know of and will then act accordingly.

Shri Pachouri had asked : On what basis, can we say that we can get back those people from Pakistan ? We have no basis to say that we can get them here. The only thing that we can do is, try to persuade the Government of Pakistan to apprehend them and to hand them over to us. The other question that was asked is whether international pressure was being exercised. And I have already conveyed that we have approached a number of friendly countries to assist us in this, it is not possible for me to give the names of the countries that had been approached. They have been approached or, the basis of the investigating agencies suggesting it to, us and on the basis of our impression that these countries will be of assistance to us.

question was asked: Why did we not male arrangements at the Karachi Airport '.' Madam, we nave no authority to make any arrangements at the Karachi Airport.

J think that is the main substance of the questions that have been asked by individual Members. I have tried to answer them individually. If some of them had asked similar questions, I have clubbed them together.

Thank you very much.

DR. JINENBRA KUMAR JAIN (Madhya Pradesh) : Madam, will you p'ease allow me to speak something ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMNA : No. nothing. I have to take up the Statutory Resolution and the Wild Life Protection (Amendment) Bill, 1993. We will have to finish the Bill first. Then I will ask the Minister to make the statement. The business which is listed has always precedence over any other thing. This statement of the Minister was allowed because there was some importance attached to it. That is it. So, we will finish the Wild Life Bill. I must tell the Members before hand that this Bill has ;a very limited scop;. So, please do not go wild and discuss anything under the sun.

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING SHRI K. P. SINGH DEO) : Madam, 1 will take very little time. . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : You may not take much time but others may take more time. I assure you that I will limit it also because I have given an indication that clarifications should also be limited.

SHRI G. G. SWELL (Meghalaya) : We will not ask for clarifications. We only want n copy of the statement.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Wild life is very limited. I do not know what you are opposing because if you want to say that it should not be increased from six months to eight mouths, then you say that. But 1 am not allowing you to make a big speech.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Boudicherry) : Madam, f am on a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : What is the point of order ?

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : My point of order is that according to the List of Business, Wild Life (Protection) Amendment Bill shall come before the two statements... *(interruptions)...*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Narayanasamy, there is no point of order. Will you please take your seat ? I am not entertaining your point of order about anything. . . *(.interruptions)* . . . Let mo finish this.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : We will go according to the List of Business. As per your ruling, we will go according to the List of Business. I am Just reminding you. If the House so agrees, I will have no objection. But. the tiling is that according to the List of Business...*(inerrup-tions)* ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The House has agreed.

DR. YELAMANCHILI SIVAJI (Andhra Pradesh) : The House has not *ag-reed...(interruptions)...*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I have already called...*(interruptions).*

I am not permitting. I must finish this. The business of Government has got more importance

An HON. MEMBER : The Minister's statement is not listed

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mrs. Alva, you must controlyour own Members. They do not understand the importance of the Bill. I do not understand *this...(interruptions)...* There is no point of order.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : It is not a question of controlling the Members.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : It is a Government business You should understand this. It has got precedence over any other business. Please take your seat.,. *(interruptions)...* Mr Narayanasamy, please sit down...*(interruptions)..,.* Please, Mr. Narayanasamy, I do not understand why the Members are agitated at this hour. I have already called. I am not going to go back. I must tell the Members that I can be indulgent at times but when there is some'important business, cannot be indulgent and let everybody take the House for granted. Please take your seat. I am not allowing...*(interruptions)...* Please take your seat.

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM : This is also very important, Madam.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I have to finish this Bill.

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM : I am not speaking about, the Information Minister's statement,

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : That is all. . . *(interruptions)*.. . That is all. Please, everybody should have peace here . . . *(interruptions)* ... I do not understand what is this disapproval.

DR. JINENDRA KUMAR JAIN: You will understand if only I am permitted to speak.

उपसभापति : बोलिए । डिसएप्रूव करिये, जो भी करना है ।

I. STATUTORY RESOLUTION SEEKING DISAPPROVAL THE WILD LIFE (PROTECTION) AMENDMENT ORDINANCE, 1993

II. THE WILD LIFE (PROTECTION) AMENDMENT BILL, 1993.

DR. JINENDRA KUMAR JAIN (Madhya Pradesh) : Madam, I thank you for allowing me to move the Resolution. I move :

> "That this House disapproves of the Wild Life (Protection) Amendment Ordinance, 1993 (No. 7 of 1993) promulgated by the President 'on the 2nd January, 1993."